

Playing the Part: A Modern Look at Immigration and Identity Through *Aeschylus' Suppliant Maidens*

Phoenicia Schwidkay
Classics Department
University of North Carolina Asheville
One University Heights
Asheville, North Carolina 28804 USA

Faculty Advisor: Dr. Sophie J. V. Mills

Abstract

“Zeus Protector, protect us with care. From the subtle sand of the Nile delta our ship set sail. And we deserted: from a holy precinct bordering Syria we fled into exile...” This quote is from the first lines of Aeschylus’ *Suppliant Maidens*, a Greek tragedy that follows a group of young women who come to Argos to flee forced marriage to their cousins. Pelasgus, King of Argos, worries that granting them asylum will bring war. With the help of Danaus, father of the fleeing daughters, the King convinces the city to grant them entrance. But safety is quickly snatched away, as the Egyptian cousins arrive to take their betrothed. Pelasgus catches wind of the trouble and brings an armed force, causing the herald cousin from Egypt to threaten war as he withdraws. The Maidens pray for safety in a new land, safety from their old home, and that they may be seen as people in need, not a threat to a country. Yet throughout the play, they are judged by their ethnicity, gender, and intentions. Their search for asylum from Argos leaves them vulnerable in a new country, and the King’s inability to see past their “barbaric” qualities makes them even more vulnerable. The issues this play deals with remain prevalent in our culture to this day. By discussing issues raised by the play of racial and gender identity, immigration politics, and the internal conflict between human empathy and the state’s morality, this paper acknowledges the plights these women faced and makes connections to issues seen currently in the United States, in hopes of exploring the state of this country and reconnecting with our humanity.

1. Introduction

“Zeus Protector, protect us with care. From the subtle sand of the Nile delta our ship set sail. And we deserted: from a holy precinct bordering Syria we fled into exile...”¹ This quote is from the first lines of the Greek tragedy *Suppliants* by Aeschylus, a tale of asylum-seeking maidens. They pray for safety in a new land, safety from their old home, and that they may be seen as people in need, not a threat to a country.

At the beginning of *Suppliants*, a chorus of Egyptian maidens have arrived at a sacred grove near Argos. Their goal: seeking asylum at their paternal homeland in order to escape forced marriage to their cousins. Their father, Danaus, aids them in the process of supplication, teaching them how to create a suppliant wreath made from the wood of an olive tree and wool, used to show those who happen upon them that they mean no harm.² He teaches them which gods to call upon in prayer at the sacred grove, thanking them for a safe voyage to Argos and for their aid in being granted protection from impious marriage.³

The King of Argos, Pelasgus, arrives at the grove, and instead of seeing the maidens as a group of people in need, questions from whence these barbarians came.⁴ The maidens attempt to convince the King of their Greek heritage, explaining the reason they seek asylum is to escape forced marriage to their cousins.⁵ Pelasgus worries that accepting them into his city would result in war. But, bound by the fear of the gods at the altar to help those in need, Danaus and King Pelasgus depart to the city to take the matter to the citizens.⁶ The maidens continue their fervent prayers as they are left at the grove, in hopes that the gods “Remove the pride of men...” and change their fate to “...a happy tale”.⁷

Danaus returns with news that the Argives have decided to grant them asylum. But, a more pressing matter has arisen: the boat of the Egyptian cousins has been spotted off the coast. As the maidens worry about their impending doom, their father leaves to notify the citizens, reminding the Danaids that the Argives would not revoke their asylum at a time like this.⁸ Soon after their father leaves, the Herald of the Egyptians arrives, ordering the Danaids to get on the boats to return back home. The maidens lament their cousins' presence, attempting to strike fear into them with the news that they have been accepted for asylum in Argos. The Herald refuses to be intimidated, stating that he does not fear gods that are not his own. Right as the cousins move to force the Danaids on the boat, the King of Argos returns with troops and forces the Herald to leave without the maidens.⁹ As the Herald embarks, he declares the King's actions as a declaration of war. With the cousins sent away, the King calls upon his attendants to aid the maidens into the city. The Danaids are guided into the city by the citizens, grateful to the gods that they are safe, marking the end of the play.

The date of *Suppliants* remains uncertain to this day. It was considered to be the earliest Greek tragedy for a long time, with its suggested creation placed in the 490s BCE. Modern critics considered the dramatic technique of the play archaic: the lyrics of the chorus outnumbered the dialogue and Aristotle's discussion in *Poetics* noted that such elements were predominant in early tragedy.¹⁰ However, the discover of an ancient *didascalia*, or dramatic record, shows that Aeschylus's *Danaids* beat Sophocles in 468 BCE, and that Aeschylus won with *Seven against Thebes* in the following year.¹¹ This would place the date of the *Suppliants* between 467 BCE, the date *Seven against Thebes* was written, and 458 BCE, the date of *Oresteia*. If a fragment of text in the first line of the record is the name of the archon "Arch<edemides>", it can further be speculated that the production of this play is 463 BCE.¹²

There have also been attempts to date *Suppliants* based on allusion to historical events happening at the time,¹³ a suggestion drawing from Aeschylus' *Persians*, a dramatization of the historical events of the battle of Salamis in 472 BCE. However, little is known about the political environment the play could be referring to, because of the uncertainty of the year it was created. The fictional situation of the Danaids seeking asylum in Argos mirrors Themistocles, who, after being ostracized from Athens, sought refuge at Argos in 470 BCE.¹⁴ But, the events of 462 BCE may align more closely with this play. A Spartan named Perikleidas came to Athens as a suppliant to request support against the uprising of the helots and Messenians at Ithome. The war that resulted in helping Perikleidas resembles the proposed war that the Herald of Egypt threatens Pelasgus, the fictional King of Argos, with for providing asylum to the Danaids.¹⁵

Given how the play ends, one would assume that there would be a continuation of the Danaids' tale. *Suppliants* is part of a tragic trilogy, with the possible association of a satyr-play called *Amydone* being a continuation of the maidens' story. The titles of the remaining plays in the trilogy are *Egyptians* and *Danaids*. However, *Suppliants* is the only play in this series for which a full version exists. Because of this, its place in the trilogy is under question, with the content of the other plays under question as well.¹⁶ Two fragments remain from *Danaids*, and connections to the myth associated with Danaus and his daughters shed enough light on its plot that it can be placed as the last play of the trilogy.¹⁷ One fragment describes the practice of waking songs "...sung by friends of the bride and group the morning after their wedding¹⁸." While we can only speculate whose lines these belonged to, the myth surrounding the maidens mentions that they were eventually forced to marry their cousins and their father urged them to kill their husbands on their wedding night.¹⁹ The second fragment is a verse spoken by Aphrodite suggested to be a defense of Hypermetra, another connection to the Danaid myth where she was the only daughter that did not participate in the plot to kill their husbands.²⁰

Only the title for *Egyptians* remains, preserved by the aforementioned ancient record. *Egyptians* could be the start of the trilogy, in which Papadopoulou suggests it was set in Egypt and told the tale of the Danaids' flight from their homeland.²¹ Or, Papadopoulou continues, it could be the second play, where the Herald of Egypt and the cousins return to Argos to enact the war they threatened at the end of *Suppliants*.²² Both cases continue to draw parallels to the myth. For the purpose of this paper, arguments that are presented are based upon *Suppliants* being the start of the trilogy, backed by information from Apollodorus' *Library* where Danaus feared the sons of Egyptus and, with the advice from Athena, built a ship to flee to Argos with his 50 daughters.²³

Modern receptions of this play are relatively rare, but David Greig took on the task of writing a new production of *The Suppliant Women* in 2016 for the Royal Lyceum Theatre Edinburgh. Director Ramin Gray previously worked with Greig in a performance called *The Events*, where their use of a choir and two actors reminded Gray of ancient Greek tragedy.²⁴ Gray spent a long time trying to find a Greek play to do in a similar fashion and chose Aeschylus' *Suppliants*, looking at the nature of rights for women and asylum seekers. Gray claims the reason this play is not as popular as some of Aeschylus' other works is because the choral maidens act as the protagonist, a rare occurrence in Greek plays from this time.²⁵ The chorus in ancient Greek plays typically were an anonymous group of at least 12-15 members that were unaffected by the play, to witness and react through song and dance.²⁶ Greig's re-envisioning stays true to the original by keeping the choral maidens as protagonist, noting that the use of volunteers instead of

professional actors in the community chorus allowed them to be “plumbed the people of the city into the play”.²⁷ A new chorus is created in each city the production takes place to reinforce this idea, with productions having taken place in the United Kingdom, Ireland, and Hong Kong. By using women that are from the community the play is being put on, the plight of the choral maidens is drawn out, allowing an overlay of their struggles with identity, women’s rights, and morality onto issues currently faced with women, foreigners, and people of color.

The issues dealt with by the characters in the play echoes issues currently seen in the United States. From reading the original text, I highlight three issues the characters deal with that are also seen in modern times: identity in the sense of race and gender, immigration politics, and struggles political leaders face when it comes to helping those in need and helping their own citizens. Using *Suppliants* as a lens, the aim of this paper is to shed light on the issues currently seen with immigration and identity in the United States.

2. Race and Gender Identity

Throughout the play, Danaus guides his daughters in the customs of his homeland, teaching them the mannerisms of Argive citizens and the process of supplication. Supplication plays an important role in this play because it magnifies their feminine and racial identities.

The act of supplication requests modest and submissive behavior, since the suppliant is in a helpless position and requesting protection from their hosts. Their father informs the maidens that they should not be “talkative nor yet a laggard be in speech...”²⁸ reminding them that they are the ones in need and rashness does not benefit the weak.²⁹ The maidens were trapped by the role of suppliant: they could not defend themselves verbally, else they may risk offending those giving them aid and lose their chance at asylum.

This idea of modest behavior in a helpless position was noted in the testimony of Dr. Christine Blasey Ford regarding sexual assault allegations against now Supreme Court Associate Judge, Brett Kavanaugh. Whereas Kavanaugh was able to react with anger and emotion, Ford had to remain calm as she recounted a painful memory, and even used her expertise in psychology to explain how the human brain creates memories when processing traumatic experiences.³⁰ The possibility of displaying any emotion would affect the credibility of her testimony, not only by the senators in the room, but to the public that watched as well.

Geoffrey Bakewell brings to attention the topic of the sexuality of the Danaids. He claims that their foreignness gives them an exotic allure, and “their metic status makes them more sexually independent and available”³¹ than the female citizens of Argos. His point of view seems rather to shame the maidens, turning their legitimate asylum seeking into an agenda with claims that they pose a threat to the idea of family values in antiquity. Women were viewed as property at that time, and the maidens fleeing forced marriage challenges that perception. Although Bakewell perceives that change as a threat, it seems that the maidens are only opposed to the idea of forced marriage to their cousins³² and “... ill marriage and a bad husband”.³³ Such a perception is prevalent amongst Muslim women living in the United States, where not only do they feel the demands of traditional cultural norms from their home countries, “...but they are also pressured to conform to American core values and norms”.³⁴ In a study done by Hu et al, women who practiced Islam that immigrated to the United States were support of family involvement in marriage. The study went on to clarify that “...such decisions must involve and win the approval and acceptance of family members...” which included arranged marriage and personally selected partners.³⁵ With both the Danaids and the study done by Hu, neither group is opposed to the idea of marriage, just the idea of it being to unideal partners.

3. Immigration Politics

Although the Danaids have come to Argos for asylum, their label as foreigner prevents them from being seen as individuals in need. It is understandable that when accepting foreigners into a new land, there may be concern over their purpose or whether their claim is valid. Geoffrey Bakewell mentions that “...the play explicitly reminds its audience of the challenges that newcomers pose to the identity and well-being of the city that takes them in”.³⁶ But what makes this viewpoint so infuriating is that it is a mindset seen in modern day. This mindset grows more concerning as the migrant caravan from Central America nears the southern border of the United States.

The process for obtaining asylum in the United States requires the person seeking that status to first be present in the country, “...seeking protection because they have suffered persecution or fear that they will suffer persecution due to: Race, Religion, Nationality, Membership in a particular social group, or Political opinion”.³⁷ If that individual is eligible, then they must file a Form I-589, Application for Asylum and for Withholding of Removal, within one year

of arrival. But if the first step is for that individual to be present in the United States, that poses issues for those with the migrant caravan. President Trump's stance on immigration paints these people who are fleeing persecution, poverty and violence as "...invaders and must immediately be deported without trial".³⁸ A report by the Unitarian Universalist Service Committee notes that the U.S. government lacks compassion in the way they responded to the asylum seekers, and that the Trump administration's treatment of separating families at the U.S. border is a way to limit "... [the migrant families] ability to successfully apply for asylum".³⁹ Not only has there been a major public outcry in regards to the treatment, the United Nations noted that this practice is a violation of international law which "...amounts to arbitrary and unlawful interference in family life, and is a serious violation of the rights of the child".⁴⁰

The leaders in both the play and modern United States worry about what will happen to their country if they grant these newcomers asylum. But, the United States government is so caught up in the paperwork and laws that it seems they forget its people's lives they are dealing with. Whereas, the process the Danaids went through was community-oriented and backed by a religious obligation to help those in need.

The need to differentiate those who were neither citizens nor slaves called for the creation of a term that applied to freed persons who lived in the polis that did not have citizenship. One of the most common terms was *metoikos* ("livers-with"), a status that originates from the time of Cleisthenes as he incorporated many foreigners and slaves into Athens, officially recognizing immigrants by law. Metic-status granted the same protections and responsibilities that citizens were allowed. In return, they were responsible for such things as a poll-tax (*metoikion*) and military service⁴¹. However, with the Danaids' requesting asylum as suppliants, the citizens of Argos have to accept them into their city due to religious obligations.

In the opening line of the play the maidens call upon Zeus Protector, who is the "protector of suppliants".⁴² They then inform the gods that they are seeking asylum "condemned not for murder by a city's decree, but by self-imposed banishment abhorring impious marriage..."⁴³ letting them know their request is not tainted by bloodshed. As Pelasgus requests that the Danaids explain how they are able to claim Argos as their race, we see the King's willingness to aid the suppliants starts to wane once he realizes that providing them aid may incite a war with Egypt.⁴⁴ The maidens allude to them having supplicated properly, noting their suppliant wreaths made of olive wood and wool and reminding Pelasgus of the wrath of Zeus Protector.⁴⁵ The King is reminded of his "divinely-sanctioned obligation that binds one to respect suppliants..."⁴⁶ Acknowledging his obligation, he poses the request, and the war it may bring, before his citizens. Although Pelasgus has the power as King to grant the Danaids aid, his inclusion of the citizens portrays him as a benevolent king, concerned for the wellbeing of his country in case war may come. But with his citizens unanimously granting the Danaids with asylum, that makes the King look as if he was trying to find a way out of granting them asylum.

4. Morality vs. Politics

After the Danaids prove their lineage and reasons for seeking asylum, Pelasgus acknowledges that they have supplicated properly. But, he informs them that he must bring the suppliants' plea to the citizens since they are not suppliants at his own hearth.⁴⁷ Michael Gagarin goes as far to claim that "...early Greeks lacked our concept of moral responsibility,"⁴⁸ which is a moot point when considering the Argive's religious obligations in helping suppliants. The concern here is with the King's feelings towards the Danaids. One of the King's first lines of the play is a comment on the Danaid's appearance, calling them barbarians.⁴⁹ As the maidens attempt to prove their Greek heritage, he does not believe them and compares them to Libyan and Amazonian women. Perhaps Pelasgus' first impressions of the maidens are disruptive to his idea of foreigners: they do not look like his fellow Argives, yet they speak the language and are following the customs. Lynette G. Mitchell notes that "... the daughters of Danaus are both insiders and outsiders, and Pelasgus sums up the ambiguity of their position when he calls them *astoxeinoi*, citizen-strangers".⁵⁰ Based on how he viewed them before and after they were granted asylum, the concern is that he does not fully accept them. And if he does not fully accept them, then that would make it okay for the citizens to feel the same.

With the stance the current administration in the United States holds regarding immigration, there is growing concern regarding an emboldening of nativism that resembles post-abolitionism America, where the targets are now undocumented and Muslim immigrants.⁵¹ Immigration is perceived as a threat to our society by native-born citizens, with media and politicians framing it as a national security issue.⁵² Some citizens believe that Muslim immigrants are unable to assimilate, that they "...come from a culture that is too different to that of the native-born; and that they cling to their culture, religious traditions, and language without adapting to American culture".⁵³ There is an expectation for immigrants to assimilate to American culture that requires them to leave their native cultural identity behind, which included their language and cultural practices. But even as immigrants and people of color try to be a

part of society, implicit biases act as a continuous reminder of our differences instead of an acceptance of ones' cultural identity. A report done on discrimination and race relations in America notes that Dominicans, West Indians, and Puerto Ricans who are often misidentified as African Americans "...may also try to signal their ethnic difference from [them]".⁵⁴ Workplace discrimination promotes an attitude of "...how good one can be, to show that one is better than all the other workers so that individual characteristics can end up trumping racial stereotypes".⁵⁵ And discrimination in our public schools is reflected by students "...being put in bilingual education classes when they did not need them and being criticized for not speaking English correctly".⁵⁶

5. Conclusion

Though *Suppliants* is fiction, it is hard not to see its relevance to the contents of the play to what is happening right now in the United States. The founding fathers of the United States looked to the Greeks to establish a form of democracy that would benefit all. But even at that time the right of citizenship was not meant for everyone. For the Danaids, Argos was a chance for a fresh start, akin to how many people come to America to live the American Dream. What is concerning is that the issues these fictional characters face are actualized amongst citizens, both legal and undocumented. Perhaps the reason *Suppliants* is not a popular play to recreate, is because the people who would find the story relevant cannot access it. Greig's adaptation of *Suppliants* comes at a time of much needed visibility, the struggles that women and immigrants face are common occurrences through history.

There is a constant fight for equality and opportunity within individual groups, who seem to think the only way to win is by isolating. The ideas of citizenship this country is founded on needs to be re-evaluated in order for all citizens to feel truly equal, which may require a look at humanity and the treatment of others. When sudden change happens, it is expected that there would be resistance. But the longer we fight it, the longer we stand divided instead of united. If this play can teach us anything, it is that, regardless of our differences, there is still a chance we as a country can come together to help those in need.

6. Endnotes

1 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, Translated by S.G. Benardete, (Chicago & London: The University of Chicago Press, 1956), lines 1-5.

2 Fred S. Naiden, *Ancient Supplication*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), doi:10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195183412.001.0001.

3 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, lines 180-233.

4 Ibid., lines 235.

5 Ibid., lines 332-35.

6 Ibid., lines 469-523.

7 Ibid., lines 525-599.

8 Ibid., lines 764-776.

9 Ibid., lines 909-16.

10 Thalia Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, (London: Bristol Classical Press, 2011), 15.

11 Ibid., 16.

12 Alan H. Sommerstein, *Suppliants*, Edited by Alan H. Sommerstein, Translated by Alan H. Sommerstein, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2008), 280.

13 A. F. Garvie, *Aeschylus' Supplices: Play and Trilogy*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1969), 141.

14 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 66-7.

15 Ibid., 67.

16 Garvie, *Aeschylus' Supplices: Play and Trilogy*, 183.

17 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 19.

18 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 20.

19 Jennifer Clarke Kosak, "Danaids," in *Oxford Encyclopedia of Ancient Greece and Rome* (Oxford University Press, 2010),

<http://www.oxfordreference.com.proxy177.nclive.org/view/10.1093/acref/9780195170726.001.0001/acref-9780195170726-e-341>.

20 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 20.

-
- 21 Ibid., 18.
- 22 Ibid., 18.
- 23 Apollodorus, *The Library, with an English Translation by Sir James George Frazer*, Translated by Sir James George Frazer, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1921), <https://bit.ly/2BLFhdu>, 2.1.4.
- 24 Ben Brantley, "Review: In 'The Events,' a Shooting Leaves a Survivor in Purgatory," *The New York Times*, February 12, 2015, <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/02/13/theater/review-in-the-events-a-shooting-leaves-a-survivor-in-purgatory.html>.
- 25 "The Making of The Suppliant Women" YouTube. Video File. September 29, 2016. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Pj_qYUeYU2A.
- 26 Oliver Taplin, "A New Pair of Pairs: Tragic Witnesses in Western Greek Vase Painting?" Chap. 8 in *Visualizing the Tragic: Drama, Myth, and Ritual in Greek Art and Literature*, Edited by Chris Klaus, Simon Goldhill, Helene P. Foley and Jas Elsner (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 189.
- 27 "The Making of The Suppliant Women" YouTube.
- 28 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, line 200.
- 29 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, 12.
- 30 Johanna Ferreira, "Why Christine Blasey Ford Couldn't Afford To Display Intense Emotions Like Brett Kavanaugh Did," September 28, 2018, <https://hiplatina.com/christine-ford-brett-kavanaugh-emotions/>.
- 31 Geoffrey W. Bakewell, *Aeschylus's Suppliant Women: The Tragedy of Immigration* (Madison, Wisconsin: The University of Wisconsin Press, 2013), 60.
- 32 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, lines 1053-54.
- 33 Ibid., lines 1064-65.
- 34 Chin Hu and others, "Gender identity and religious practices of first-generation muslim women immigrants in the U.S." in *Making Connections* 11 (2009): 51. <http://0-search.proquest.com.wncln.wncln.org/docview/201630457?accountid=8388>.
- 35 Ibid., 56.
- 36 Bakewell, *Aeschylus's Suppliant Women: The Tragedy of Immigration*, 11.
- 37 USCIS, "Obtaining Asylum in the United States" October 19, 2015, <https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/refugees-asylum/asylum/obtaining-asylum-united-states>.
- 38 Philip Rucker and David Weigel, "Trump advocates depriving undocumented immigrants of due-process rights." *The Washington Post*, June 25, 2018, https://www.washingtonpost.com/powerpost/trump-advocates-depriving-undocumented-immigrants-of-due-process-rights/2018/06/24/dfa45d36-77bd-11e8-93cc-6d3becdd7a3_story.html?utm_term=.6dcf11fc779f.
- 39 Rachel Gore Freed and others, "THE UNITED STATES FOLLOWS HUNGARY'S DANGEROUS PATH TO DISMANTLING ASYLUM", (Cambridge: Unitarian Universalist Service Committee, 2018), https://www.uusc.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/DismantlingAsylum_Report_W.pdf, 4-5
- 40 Nick Cumming-Bruce, "Taking Migrant Children From Parents Is Illegal, U.N. Tells U.S." *The New York Times*, June 5, 2018, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/06/05/world/americas/us-un-migrant-children-families.html>.
- 41 David Whitehead, "metic" in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, edited by Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), doi:10.1093/acref/9780198606413.001.0001.
- 42 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 39.
- 43 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, lines 5-8
- 44 Ibid., lines 341-2.
- 45 Ibid., line 345.
- 46 Papadopoulou, *Aeschylus: Suppliants*, 41.
- 47 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, lines 365-70
- 48 Michael Gagarin, *Aeschylean Drama*, (Berkeley and Los Angeles, California: University of California Press, 1976), 7.
- 49 Aeschylus, *The Suppliant Maidens*, lines 234-37.
- 50 Lynette G. Mitchell, "GREEKS, BARBARIANS AND AESCHYLUS' SUPPLIANTS", in *Greece & Rome* (The Classical Association, no. 53 (2006), doi:<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0017383506000283>, 216.
- 51 J. G. Young, "Making america 1920 again? nativism and US immigration, past and present", in *Journal on Migration and Human Security*, <http://0-search.proquest.com.wncln.wncln.org/docview/1931263153?accountid=8388>.
- 52 Ibid., 227.
- 53 Ibid., 228.

54 Mary C Waters and Philip Kasnitz, "Discrimination, Race Relations, and the Second Generation", in *Social Research* no. 77 (2010) <http://0-search.proquest.com.wncln.wncln.org/docview/872088175?accountid=8388>, 123
55 Ibid., 124.
56 Ibid., 113-114.